

2022 WIAA Area Meetings

DISCUSSION TOPIC #2

Competitive Balance Ad Hoc Committee

Discussion Questions:

- Is six points over a 3-year period an appropriate amount of points to activate the performance factor?
- If a team is promoted to a higher division based on performance points, should they have the opportunity to appeal?
- What feedback do you have about the request process for schools that are seeking divisional placement relief?

Fox Valley Lutheran

- Individual performance in track by one athlete could move a team up. Team state title was won, mainly because of the results of one girl.
- Will there be transparency about movement from divisions or what factors moved a particular team in the request process?
- Yes to the appeal process
- Support the appeal process. Also want to look at what is going on with enrollment issues in regard to special education.
- It puts it on the districts to present their case (we like that).

Greenfield

Back-right group

- You go to state and win state, then graduate that state class. Is that a negative effect? Is that an ability to appeal when you have a graduating class? How is the talent determined?
- Is there a benefit to not focusing on the talent when a certain class graduates?
- What is the inference effect of a sport's program that has talented graduating classes?
- Why two years versus three or four years?
- Can a team request not to be dropped?
- Is there an appeal to go down without the performance factors?
- How does performance factors translate for schools that fluctuate from one division to another because they sit near a division cutoff.
- Is there any consideration given to the success of the conference?
- Can a football-only group appeal when they do not hit the four-win mark but believe they have a quality playoff team due to strength of their overall conference?
- This is something that is needed based on factors beyond enrollment.
- Has an open division ever been considered?
- What happens when a team/school is in a probationary period?
- Is there a limit to how many divisions you can appeal down?
- Is there a time period for dropping down or appealing to be considered to drop year over year?

Front-right group

- Perhaps there should be a win state point v. a qualify for state title
- Started as a basketball focus, is this all sports now
- Where does socio-economics play into this - is there a reducer
- Is this more of an issue for D3-D5 only school - not D1 or D2
- Is there historic data so we could see the impact

Center-right group

- 3 years is too short - one graduating class can skew it
- Perhaps 5 or 6 years is a minimum
- You will never truly have competitive balance
- Socio-economics is only a factor in the appeal - not in the point system
- Does just trying something suffice if we can never really get to something that works?
- Appeal process helps to rectify if your talent has left from your successful run (didn't exist in 2014 attempt)
- What is your long-term goal? What is the objective?

Center-left group

- Why is free and reduced lunch utilized? *can be used as a potential appeal item
- Where did the 6 point system come from?
- Data...how many schools would have truly been impacted over the past 6-7 years? Can this data be broken down by sport?
- This does seem to be the best plan based on the rural/urban & multiplier
- Schools should always have the opportunity to appeal (graduation impact)
- A school might be in a weaker sectional; will be more or less penalized/moved up due to this
- Subjective appeal process
- Schools could be moved even though they do not reach the top of their sport (state champion)
- Could end up being in two different divisions within the same sport season (ex: wrestling, track & field)

Front-left group

- D1 school moves down, now what about a non-competitive d2 school on the bubble moves up?
- Can you show us the real impact using this data on actual performance results from 2014-2020? What would have changed? What is the target for the number of teams impacted? Why 6 points vs. 7 or 8?
- Appeals: is talent a factor for winning an appeal? How do we objectively justify that?

Back-left group

- Yes they should be able to appeal. Graduating class can impact team success.
- Schools should be able to appeal
- School regardless of enrollment do not have the facilities, infrastructure, budgets, etc to compete with other schools in division.
- point system 2 years phase over six year plan.
- Can you move lower division based on performance ex: going from D1 down to D3 on
- Socioeconomics play a huge factor in the number of students who can participate in sports.

Mauston

Center-Right Group:

- Enrollment - kids in seats that are eligible to participate
- Good place to start - no perfect way
- Need to have the appeal process
- Could elevate overall athletics
- Question: If a school moves down a division, is it automatically the largest school, by enrollment, in the lower division that automatically moves up even if that school has had a of success in their current lower division?

Lower front group:

- Lots of work done. Need to give it a chance. Step in the right direction.
- Can we get clarification on why 6 points?
- If a school requests to go down, does another school have to go up with less than 6 points?
- Step in the right direction, solid effort
- Is the appeal process open and transparent or more of a closed process?

Oconomowoc

- This is a good starting point
- This avoids some discriminatory aspects of other plans (public v private, rural v urban)
- Tournament games against small schools from cities that draw from a much larger area --
- Question about whether we should "punish" schools for their success
- The students moved up are not the schools that earned the move.
- 6 may not be enough -- a single group of talented students could earn this in grades 10 & 11 without ever winning, and senior year, their last chance to win in their division, they are moved up.

Rice Lake

- Makeup there is merit for this. Issue still may be private/public that said there does seem to be inequity works help.
- Negative impact on a school for one good class.
- Private entities in an urban setting have more advantages than a school of similar size in a non urban setting.
- How would this affect CO-op placement.
- We need to try something
- We like the appeals committee
- We also like the fact that it is only sectionals and state. We discussed how this could impact. We would like to see open enrollment and location/area that they are pulling from. Where is the student's residence?
- Start with 6 as a trial run and then be willing to adjust from there.
- Can we take more into account in terms of Socio-economic status

Antigo

- When do placements for divisions plan on being released
- Smaller sized D6 team being moved up to D5 is not ideal (football)
- For schools that regularly change divisions, where does a decision for "success" take place in terms of divisions?
- Agreement on how this is not an easy topic and thanks to those on committee
- Time frame of release of initial placements prior to appeals. As well, how will the appeal process be handled for transparency.
- Add Regional title as part of the success factor..?

Mount Horeb

- Why apply to individual sports related to divisional placement ie wrestling, tennis and tournament placements
- Geography related to tournament placement, ie Division 2 schools in SW Wisconsin
- When does points accumulation start for implementation in 24-25, what is the retroactive historical impacts - school apply
- Does this reduce co-ops and co-op opportunities
- How do team sports with an individual component impact points (i.e. individuals qualified for state, but the team did not...are points awarded for that)?
- Is the cycle too short? Or should the number of points be upped to buffer a really good group of kids?
- Would points retroactively apply or does everyone start at 0 if this kicks in?
- How will it work in sports where different genders compete at the same site (i.e. track & field) if one of the genders gets moved up and the other does not? May impact coaching staff if shared.
- Is three years too short for impact of that special "class" impact
- What does appeal process and rubric look like - meetings, documentation needed, etc